

RYR 374: Cornwall – Lostwithiel to Fowey

Aim: Introduce a rail and river boat passenger service between Lostwithiel and Fowey using an existing freight line.		Scheme type	New service
		Region	South West
Overall comment: Whilst this proposal provides detailed cost assumptions and evidence of engagement with stakeholders, the transport and economic elements of the case require strengthening; the proposal focusses on tourism benefits but is lacking detail regarding alignment with levelling up and addressing a specific transport issue.			
Scheme Criteria	Review of Proposal Content	Further Considerations for any future Business Case submissions (Orange – areas requiring further detail, Black – suggestions to strengthen case)	
The scheme has the potential to deliver wider benefits – homes, jobs, GDP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal makes a case for the scheme by referencing a tourist market and the potential to connect people and jobs, however, details surrounding these benefits are lacking. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Further detail regarding labour markets and employers, and detail on how the scheme might connect these and offer benefit over existing routes. Further detail regarding the potential for tourism users, possibly by benchmarking schemes elsewhere. Demonstrate how the scheme aligns with local and regional policy objectives. Demonstrate specific consideration around the seasonality of the service and how this might impact benefits. 	
The scheme has credible potential transport benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal highlights a lack of existing public transport provision between Lostwithiel and Fowey and references the potential for carbon emission reduction. However, evidence that this scheme is the best solution to the issues is not clear. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrate consideration of alternative schemes and evidence as to why the proposed rail scheme is more beneficial, addressing key issues with the proposed scheme such as the lack of direct access to the centre of Fowey. Demonstrate consideration of wider connectivity benefits for onward travel. 	
The scheme is credible in deliverability and potential cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Costs are provided with a good breakdown of assumptions, though the actual figures are considered optimistic. Potential issues identified regarding land ownership. Passive provision for re-instating the bay platform at Lostwithiel has been made. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inclusion of a risk register with proposed mitigations. Provision of a more detailed (though still indicative) project timeline. Demonstrate further consideration of accessibility and feasibility issues regarding the river boat proposed interchange. 	
The impact of the scheme on the railway is likely to be proportionate and acceptable – both during the work and in ‘steady state’	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A good level of consideration is given to the potential disruption of freight services and the wider network (at Lostwithiel) during upgrade of the line for passenger services Some risks are identified such as the need to upgrade level crossings; clarity of risks would be improved by a more comprehensive risk register. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The complexities of joint running passenger and freight on the same line has been highlighted during the review process as a significant risk therefore should continue to be fully considered in any future iterations of the case. 	
There is support for the scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal illustrates widespread support for the scheme. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrate evidence of engagement and support from Cornwall Council. 	
The scheme has the potential for leveraging third party funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal considers third-party funding options but no further evidence of commitment is shown. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide evidence of engagement and outcomes with funding sources. 	
Other additional information required			